

Is Gangs Of New York A True Story

Is Gangs Of New York A True Story

Downloaded from
www.whlarchitecture.com by
Blankenship & Baldwin

INTRODUCTION: SEPARATING HISTORICAL FACT FROM CINEMATIC LEGEND

Few historical epics have captured the brutal imagination of audiences quite like Martin Scorsese's 2002 film **Gangs of New York**. Set in the lawless slums of mid-19th century Manhattan, the movie paints a visceral picture of tribal warfare, political corruption, and immigrant struggle. But for many viewers, the central question lingers long after the credits roll: **Is Gangs of New York a true story?** The answer is more layered than a simple yes or no. The film is a masterful blend of documented historical events, real-life figures, and fictionalized drama. While the broad strokes of the era are accurate, the specific characters and their personal vendettas were largely invented for the screen. To fully understand **Is Gangs of New York a true story**, we must dig into the actual history of the Five Points, the real gangs that terrorized the city, and the creative liberties Scorsese took to bring this world to life.

THE HISTORICAL FOUNDATION: THE REAL FIVE POINTS

The setting of the film is undeniably real. The **Five Points** neighborhood in Lower Manhattan was indeed one of the most infamous slums in American history. Named for the five-way intersection of Mulberry Street, Anthony Street (now Worth Street), and Orange Street (now Baxter Street), this area was a dense, disease-ridden warren of tenement housing, dance halls, and saloons. During the mid-1800s, it became home to successive waves of Irish, Italian, German, and Chinese immigrants, all competing for survival in a society that offered them little. This context is crucial when exploring **Is Gangs of New York a true story**, because the environment depicted in the film reflects genuine historical conditions. Crime, poverty, and ethnic violence were rampant. The city's police force was small, poorly trained, and often corrupt. In this vacuum, street gangs held enormous power over their respective turfs.

Herbert Asbury's "The Gangs of New York"

Much of the film's source material comes from Herbert Asbury's 1927 non-fiction book, also titled *The Gangs of New York: An Informal History of the Underworld*. Asbury was a journalist and writer who documented the exploits of the city's criminal underworld from the early 1800s to the Prohibition era. However, it is important to note that Asbury's book is not a rigorous academic history. It reads more like a collection of colorful anecdotes, tall tales, and newspaper accounts, some of which were likely exaggerated or even fabricated by the press of the time. When asking **Is Gangs of New York a true story**, one must remember that the movie is adapting a book that was already taking liberties with the truth. Asbury provided the raw material, but Scorsese and screenwriter Jay Cocks used it as a springboard for a narrative about national identity, revenge, and the birth of modern America.

REAL HISTORICAL FIGURES PORTRAYED IN THE FILM

One of the strongest arguments for the film's authenticity is its inclusion of genuine historical figures. However, their on-screen portrayals are often dramatized. Let us examine the key characters and their real-world counterparts.

William "Bill the Butcher" Cutting (Played by Daniel Day-Lewis)

The character of Bill the Butcher is largely based on **William "Bill the Butcher" Poole**, a real-life gang leader and boxer who operated in the Five Points. The historical Poole was a nativist and a member of the Know Nothing movement, which was fiercely anti-immigrant and anti-Catholic. He ran a gang known as the Bowery Boys. Like his fictional counterpart, the real Poole was a skilled butcher by trade and a fearsome street fighter. In 1855, Poole was shot and killed in a fight on Christopher Street by a man named Lewis Baker, who was associated with Irish gangs. The real Poole died weeks after the shooting. In the film, Bill the Butcher serves as a composite of Poole's nativist ideology and the brutal charisma of other gang leaders. While the character is fictionalized, his hatred for the Irish and his control over the Five Points mirror the historical pushback against immigration. Therefore, when evaluating **Is Gangs of New York a true story**, Bill the Butcher stands out as a figure rooted in reality but elevated to mythic proportions.

William "Boss" Tweed (Played by Jim Broadbent)

William M. "Boss" Tweed is portrayed in the film as a corrupt but politically savvy power broker. This depiction is remarkably accurate. Tweed was the boss of Tammany Hall, the Democratic political machine that controlled New York City politics for much of the 19th century. He used patronage, bribery, and graft to maintain power, and he was indeed intimately connected with the gangs, who would intimidate voters and stuff ballot boxes on election day. The movie captures the essence of Tweed's corruption, including the infamous courthouse that cost taxpayers millions more than it should have. Tweed was eventually convicted of fraud and died in prison. His presence in the film provides a crucial link between the street-level violence and the systemic corruption that defined the era. This adds weight to the question **Is Gangs of New York a true story**, as Tweed's involvement is historically sound.

Monk Eastman (and Other Gang Leaders)

The film features a brief appearance by **Monk Eastman**, a real gang leader who rose to power later in the 19th century, after the main events of the movie. Eastman ran the Eastman Gang and

was a major figure in the criminal underworld of the 1890s. His inclusion in the film is anachronistic (the main action takes place in the 1840s-1860s), but it serves to show the continuity of gang culture. Other historical figures like **Walter McGinnis** (the head of the Dead Rabbits in the film) are based on real gang leaders, though the specific details of their lives are largely lost to history. The film uses these figures to create a tapestry of the criminal ecosystem, but it does not adhere strictly to their biographies.

FICTIONAL CHARACTERS AND INVENTED NARRATIVES

The heart of the film's plot—the revenge story between Amsterdam Vallon and Bill the Butcher—is almost entirely fictional. This is the most significant factor to consider when answering **Is Gangs of New York a true story**.

Amsterdam Vallon (Played by Leonardo DiCaprio)

The character of **Amsterdam Vallon** is a fictional creation. While the film suggests that the Irish gang the Dead Rabbits had a leader named Priest Vallon (played by Liam Neeson), there is no historical record of a gang chieftain by that name. The name "Dead Rabbits" itself is historically disputed. Some sources claim it was a real gang, while others believe it was a nickname used by the press. The personal vendetta between Amsterdam and Bill the Butcher, with Amsterdam infiltrating the Butcher's inner circle to avenge his father's death, follows classic dramatic structure. It is a powerful narrative device, but it has no basis in documented history. This invented storyline is the primary reason why **Is Gangs of New York a true story** must be answered with a qualified no.

Jenny Everdeane (Played by Cameron Diaz)

Similarly, the character of **Jenny Everdeane** is a fictional composite. She is a thief and a pickpocket with a heart of gold, and she serves as the romantic interest. While women certainly participated in the criminal underworld of the Five Points, Jenny is not based on any specific historical figure. Her presence adds a romantic subplot that is entirely a product of screenwriting.

HISTORICAL EVENTS: FACT VS. FICTION

The film uses several major historical events as backdrops, and its treatment of these events is a mixed bag of accuracy and creative license.

The New York Draft Riots of 1863

The climactic sequence of the film takes place during the **New York City Draft Riots of 1863**. This was a real and devastating event. For four days, predominantly Irish and German working-class men and women rioted against the draft, which they saw as unfair (rich men could pay \$300 to avoid service). The violence escalated into a race riot, with the mob attacking African Americans and burning down buildings, including the Colored Orphan Asylum. The film shows the U.S. Navy firing cannons down the streets of Manhattan to quell the riot, which is historically accurate. However, the film's depiction of the gangs

setting aside their differences to fight alongside each other against the military is a dramatic invention. In reality, many gang members were among the rioters, but the idea of a unified truce between nativists and immigrants is a sentimental fiction. This sequence is often cited in discussions of **Is Gangs of New York a true story** because it captures the chaos of the event but reshapes the motivations of the participants.

The Battle of the Five Points

The opening battle of the film, a massive brawl between the Dead Rabbits and the Natives, is a fictionalized version of the kind of street violence that was common. There were indeed large-scale gang fights in the Five Points, but no single battle is recorded that matches the scale and choreography of the film. The film compresses years of sporadic violence into a single, epic confrontation for dramatic effect.

The Political System

The film's portrayal of **Tammany Hall** and its manipulation of the immigrant vote is historically accurate. Boss Tweed and his associates did control elections through bribery, intimidation, and outright fraud. The scene where immigrants are marched to the polls and told how to vote is an accurate reflection of the era's political machinery.

CULTURAL AND ETHNIC ACCURACY

Another aspect of **Is Gangs of New York a true story** involves the film's representation of ethnic groups. The film accurately shows the intense hatred between native-born Protestants (Nativists) and Irish Catholic immigrants. This was a real and driving force in New York politics and society. The Irish were stereotyped as drunken, violent, and controlled by the Pope, and they faced widespread discrimination in housing and employment. The film also touches on the early presence of African Americans in the city and their tenuous position as scapegoats during riots. However, the film simplifies the complex ethnic landscape. The Italian, German, and Chinese populations are largely background elements, whereas in reality, they played significant roles in the neighborhood's development. The answer to **Is Gangs of New York a true story** is therefore nuanced: the ethnic tensions are real, but the film focuses narrowly on the Irish-Nativist conflict to tell its story.

CREATIVE LIBERTIES AND DRAMATIC LICENSE

Martin Scorsese has always been open about the fact that he was making a movie, not a documentary. To fully understand **Is Gangs of New York a true story**, we must appreciate the choices he made:

- **Timeline Compression:** The film covers roughly 1846 to 1863, but it compresses events and ignores others. The real gangs of the era evolved over decades, with different leaders rising and falling.
- **Symbolism:** The character of Bill the Butcher is not just a historical figure; he is a symbol of the old, violent, tribal America that is being swept away by industrialization and the Civil War. Amsterdam Vallon represents a new generation trying to find its place.
- **The Irish Brigade:** The final shot of Amsterdam and Jenny walking through a field of graves after the war is meant to

evoke the sacrifice of the Irish Brigade, which fought heroically for the Union. While the brigade was real, the specific characters are not.

- **The Dead Rabbits' Identity:** The film treats the Dead Rabbits as a unified Irish gang. Historians debate whether

the Dead Rabbits were a distinct gang or just a faction within a larger group. The film simplifies this for clarity.

WHAT THE FILM GETS RIGHT

Despite its